SULZER ATTACKS MURPHY; 'M'CALL AS AGENT'

Ousted Governor, in Statement, Says the did you merely express an opinion that it ney was promptly confirmed; that Gast-Tammany Leader Offered to Pay His Heavy Debts Out of Campaign Funds.

MAYORALTY CANDIDATE GO-BETWEEN

Chairman of the Public Service Commission Spoke of Tiger Boss as "The Chief," and Brought Many of His Messages to "People's House," Is Assertion-"A Naked Fight of Dishonesty."

go to the hotel

I wanted him to meet me in the Execu

tive Chamber or come to the Executive

"He refused to do this and I declined t

Met Murphy at McCall's House.

was at Judge Edward E. McCall's house

"Now, the next time I saw Mr. Murphy

"We made an appointment to meet at

"I left Albany that afternoon for New

"He told me Mr. Murphy was at his

"We talked going down to his house

He said he would accept the Public Ser-

vice Commissionership if I would insist on

so there would be no difficulty about his

house we went upstairs and I met Mr.

Murphy in the front room. We talked

present part of the time. Then we had

"After dinner Mr. Murphy and I dis-

ussed matters at considerable length re-

McCall and the Public Service Com-

missionership.

"The subway question was very acute

"I urged the appointment of Henry

"Finally I suggested as a compromise

"We discussed the subway question, the

finally said that unless Judge McCall was

Senate the following Monday night, and

"Mr. Murphy was agreeable to the ap-

his resignation by messenger Monday

Commission, the Department of State

Prisons and the Department of High-

ways. He insisted that George M. Palmer

should be appointed chairman and Pat-

rick E. McCabe a member of the Public

Service Commission of the 2d District.

This is the 'Packy' McCabe who is Mur-

"Mr. Murphy further insisted upon hav-

ing 'The' McManus for Labor Commis-

sloner, a man named Meyers for State

Architect, a man from Brooklyn whose

name I forget for State Hospital Com-

missioner, and James E. Gaffney for

Highway Commissioner, in case I wished

to supplant Mr. Reel. Mr. Murphy sald

that Reel ought to be kept, as he was a

good man. This is the same Reel whom

"Mr. Murphy added that if I wished a

new Commissioner of Highways 'Jim'

appointment of Gaffney, and still later a

prominent New Yorker came to me in the

Executive Mansion bringing the message

from Mr. Murphy that it was 'Gaffney or

"This is the Gaffney who, only a fe

months afterward, on September 4, 1913,

in und sputed testimony before the Su-

preme Court at Nyack, was shown to have

(refusing to take a check) from one of

the aqueduct contractors, nominally for

The lines around Mr. Sulzer's mouth

"How could I, how could any honest

Governor consider such a man for such a

place?" he exclaimed. "How could I face

"Shortly before midnight we left Judge

Murphy Determined on Gaffney.

"When I removed Reel from the office

of Commissioner of Highways I began to

who was more determined than ever to

"Was this over the long distance tele-

"No, sir. When I saw Mr. Murphy at

secure the place for 'Jim' Gaffney."

phone, Mr. Sulzer?"

the people after such a surrender?

war.' I declined to appoint Gaffney.

subsequently removed.

phy's political lieutenant in Albany.

inent citizens in the city.

Morgenthau or George Foster Peabody

or Colonel John Temple Graves. Mr.

But he wanted Mr. Murphy's consent,

"When we reached Judge McCall's

York, and Judge McCall met me with his

automobile at the 125th street station.

house waiting for us.

confirmation.

Mr. Galvin.

The following interview with Gov- him at the Executive Mansion. He wanted ernor Sulzer is printed with the con- me to go to his hotel to confer with him. sent of "The Evening Mail":

By JAMES CREELMAN.

Copyright, 1913, by Mail and Express Company.

Albany, Oct. 20 .- "I appeal from the Court of Impeachment and the merely in New York City on the night of the nominal charges on which I was tried to second of February. I talked from Albany the greater and higher Court of Public with Mr. McCall over the telephone about Opinion, before which I present the true the Public Service Commissionership. and only reasons for my impeachment and removal," said Governor Suizer.

It was a few minutes after I had heard the sonorous voice of Chief Judge Cullen pronouncing the thrilling judgment in the resplendent Court of Impeachment that cast the Governor of New York from the areat office to which he was elected less than a year before.

Mr. Sulzer stood in the almost deserted Executive Mansion-tall, lean, with a calm look in his blue-gray eyes that cont asted strongly with the excitement of the murmuring throng that swirled about

the final scene of condemnation. Mrs. Sulzer was in the rooms below, already directing preparations for the with-

drawal from the stately official residence. "At last, thank God, my lips are uncea'ed," sald Mr. Sulzer. "I can now tell the people of New York what the court garding appointments. Mr. Murphy urged that has convicted me would not have me to appoint his friend, John Galvin, allowed me to tell under oath, and which Public Service Commissioner, in place of I promised my lawyers not to speak of Mr. Willcox, whose term had expired. until the verdict was given."

It seemed hard to believe that this erect. man, whose countenance once more shone with all the spirit of battle. was the condemned victim of a great in New York and great pressure had been conspiracy contrived by a political boss brought to bear on me by prominent citi-I had seen him during the most critical zens to reappoint Mr. Willcox or to let cays of his struggle to maintain himself him remain in office until the subway conagainst the tremendous forces of ven- tracts were disposed of. geance gathering for his destruction, pale,

tired, drooping and discouraged. But now his eyes were clear, his brow serene and his whole personality ani- Murphy would not hear of these men. He mated with a new energy and earnest- talked long and earnestly in behalf of

The Real Ground of Quarrel.

"I was impeached," he said, "not be- Judge McCall, McCall himself said that cause of the offences with which I was he would accept, provided it was agreecharged, but because I refused to do able to Mr. Murphy Charles F. Murphy's bidding, and, because, as the records show, I have re- proposed contracts and various other matlentlersly pursued Mr. Murphy's corrupt ters. The hour was getting late and I henchmen in office.

Mr. Sulzer strode up and down the agreeable to Mr. Murphy I would send in room, his hands locked behind his back, the name of Henry Morgenthau to the

his head held high The real charge, the real offence, the if he was not confirmed of course Mr. real ground of quarrel between myself Willcox would hold over, and that that and the corrupt political machine that | would be agreeable to a grea strove to destroy me should be known to the public.

"This has not been a fight about polltics, but a naked fight of dishonesty to crush a Governor of the State of New York because he dared to be his own

There was an unmistakable ring of sincerity in the voice of the man who, after twenty years of unstained public service. dared to attempt the overthrow of the Tammany boss and was himself over-

Murphy Offers Sulzer Money.

"Just prior to taking office as Governor either just before Christmas or between Christmas and New Year's-I spent an afternoon with Mr. Murphy at his request at his private room at Delmonico's," said the Governor. "His attitude was very friendly and confidential. He said he was my friend; that he knew of my financial condition and wished to help me out. As he went on I was amazed at his knowledge of my intimate personal affairs.

"To my astonishment he informed me that he knew that I was heavily in debt. Then he offered me money to pay my debts and have enough left to take things easy while Governor."

Did he tell you where this money was to come from, Governor?"

'He said that this was really a party matter and that the money he would "Gaffney or War," Murphy's Message. give me was party money; that I had been a popular candidate easily elected and for less money than any other can-Gaffney was the best all-around man for didate in his recollection. the job. Subsequently he demanded the

"He said that nobody would know anyowed and go to Albany feeling easy financially. He then asked me how much I needed, to whom I owed it, and other

Sulzer Refuses the Offer of Money.

"As I did not want to be tied hard and fast as Governor in advance, I declined Mr. Murphy's offer, saying that I was demanded and received \$30,000 in money paying off my debts gradually; that my creditors were friends and would not press me; that I was economical; that I 'advice.' This is the man who Mr. would try to get along on my salary as Murphy demanded should be put in a po-

sition where he would superintend and "He repeated his offer of money, saycontrol the spending of sixty-five millions ing that it was for the good of the party; of the money of the state in road conthat the 'organization' did not want me tracts." to be hampered financially, and he (Murphy) would allow me whatever I needed tightened as he recalled the scene at the above my salary for my living expenses McCall house, and his fingers twitched.

while I was at the Executive Mansion. "But again I refused, and then he said: 'If you need money at any time let me know and you can have what you want. We cleaned up a lot of money on your campaign. I can afford to let you have what you want and never miss it."

How the Boss Seeks Weak Side of a

Mr. Sulzer paused and thrust his hands in his pockets, jerking his head sidewise and pursing his lips.

"I am telling all this," he said, "because the people should know just how their elected officials are approached and tempted and how the boss seeks for the

weak side of a man to control him. "Mr Murphy did not attend my inauguration. He came to Albany for the Deimonico's before I came to Albany I titled to the place as the upstate people. Presidential electors' meeting and I saw told him plainly I would not talk ever the

would not be good policy?"

"Then he said: 'Well, if I have anything through some friend, or by Mr. Delaney, or some one in the Legislature.' I said: 'That will do.'

Conference in Washington.

"About the fifth of March, just after President Wilson's inauguration, I visited the President in the White House. When tary of Tammany Hall, in front of the White House. He wanted to know what I had said to the President and what the Governor of New York to his will the old President had said to me. I told him I deep lines came back into his face and made it a rule never to discuss conversa- his eyes grew hard. tions that I had with the President.

"Mr. Smith said Mr. Murphy wanted me and in some of these talks I told him I

"Did you say it in that blunt way, or place; that he would see to it that Ganney would make good, and that I would "Well, I had heard a good deal about never have cause to regret it. He asked the telephone talks between Albany and me again to give him a promise to appoint 'headquarters' in New York, either at 14th Gaffney. I told him I would not make a street or Delmonico's or Good Ground. promise about it; that I would consider When Mr. Murphy at this time suggested all he said, but that in my opinion Mr. that he keep in touch with me over the Gaffney would not do; that it would be telephone, I told him at once that I did a mistake to appoint him; that the people not want to talk with him over the tele- would not stand for it; that Mr. Gaffney was too close to him.

"Mr. Murphy finally said: 'I am for to say to you I will send you word Gaffney. The organization demands his appointment and I want you to do it." "I replied: 'I will make no promise

> about It.' "He said: 'It will be Gaffney or war.'

> Declared He Would Block Everything. As Mr. Sulzer continued to pace the room and tell how one man without office

"I had several talks with Mr. Murphy



CHARLES F. MURPHY.

pointment of Judge McCall, and it was understood that the judge should send me that night. He asked me if I would be there, and I said, 'Yes.

"I went to the Shoreham that night. There were present Senator O'Gorman. Appointments That Murphy Demanded Mr. Murphy, Norman E. Mack and Mr. "At this meeting and subsequently Mr. Fitzpatrick, the Murphy leader in Buffalo; Mr. McCooey, the Murphy leader Murphy demanded from me pledges re-Brooklyn; Thomas F. Smith and myself garding legislation, and especially con-State affairs were discussed in a general cerning appointments to the Public Serway. I took very little part in the talk. vice commissions, the Health Department, the Labor Department, the State Hospital

Murphy Follows Him into the Hall, thing.

New York with my staff and Mrs. Sulzer, and about 11 o'clock I shook hands with all and hade them good night.

"As I went out Mr. Murphy followed me into the hall. He told me he was very anxious to get away to Hot Springs, but didn't want to go until Albany matters

"He asked me if I would give him assurance that I would appoint his friend Jim' Gaffney Commissioner of Highways. That place, you will remember, controlled the immediate spending of \$65,000,000 for good roads, the very same work in which Mr Hennessy's investigations have recently uncovered frauds amounting to terest that I refused to consent, millions of dollars in twenty-two counties under the Reel administration.

Free Hand if He Named Gaffney.

the matter settled before he went away; that If I would appoint Mr. Gaffney I could have my own way regarding other matters."

"Do you mean to say that a man like Murphy had the audacity to speak to the Governor of New York like that?" "Oh, yes. You don't know Murphy, or

you wouldn't ask that question. "Mr. Murphy assured me that he was more interested in Gaffney's appointment than in anything else in the state; that Gaffney was a good all-around man for

the job, knew what to do and could get results! "I told him that in my opinion it would be a mistake to appoint Mr. Gaffney. I repeated to him practically what I had said at Judge McCall's house, and also of his." at his own house, a few days before.

Murphy Threatens "Gaffney or War." "Mr. Murphy said to me, 'I want you

to appoint Gaffney. It is an organization matter. I will appreciate it. "I said: 'I will consider all you say

about the matter. I want to go slow and McCall's house in his automobile and he get the very best man I can find for that and Mr. Murphy accompanied me to the position. I would rather be slow about Grand Central Depot, where I took the the appointment than be sorry.'

"And he answered: 'If you don't appoint Gaffney you WILL be sorry." "I told him that I thought the appoint-

ment for Highway Commissioner should be to an upstate man; that the people up the hear pretty vigorously from Mr. Murphy, state expected the Governor to appoint an upstate man: that there was a prevailing sentiment to that effect "He replied that there was nothing in

the money, and was just as much en-"Again Mr. Murphy said that Gaffney, had come direct from Mr. Murphy and

to meet him and some of the Democratic was the Governor; that the people elected oath of office. He laughed at this, and state leaders at Senator O'Gorman's me to be Governor, and that I intended to rooms in the Shoreham Hotel at 8 o'clock be Governor; that I was not going to be a proxy Governor or a rubber stamp." "What did he say when you asserted your independence?

"He laughed at me and rebuked me for this, and said that I might be the Gov. ernor, but that he controlled the Legislature; that unless I did what he wanted me to regarding legislation and appointconfirmed and that he would block every.

"I listened to these boasts and threats "I had made arrangements to leave for from Mr. Murphy, not once but frequently. It was all disheartening and discouragng, but I tried to be patient, to get along with him and do my best.

Peremptory Demands Almost Daily.

"While I was Governor Mr. Murphy emmunicated with me frequently, and always along these lines. From the beginning of January to April 13 there was HARDLY A DAY THAT HE DID NOT SEND SOME ONE TO SEE ME WITH PEREMPTORY DEMANDS to do this or that. Some requests were reasonable and able and so much against the people's in-"Prior to April 13 our relations politi-

cally were badly strained. I could not comply with his demands. I realized that we had come to a parting of the ways. "Mr. Murphy seemed very much I was determined to be Governor, to make aroused. He said he would like to have a good record, to do my duty according to what I believed to be right and to carry out as far as possible the platform upon which I was elected. I also wanted to treat all the upstate Democratic county organizations squarely, whether these county organizations were friendly to Mr Murphy or otherwise. That was not his

Murphy's Demand for "The" McManus.

"One talk with Mr. Murphy, which I remember very distinctly, was at his house in New York on March 18. "HE EXPRESSED GREAT INDIG-NATION BECAUSE I HAD REMOVED small way in February and continued

Prisons. I told him the reasons. He poohpoohed them, and said Scott was a friend of impeachment in obedience to Mr. Mur-"Was that the occasion, Governor Sulzer, when Mr. Murphy objected to John

Mitcheil for Commissioner of Labor?" / "Yes, that was the time." What was his objection to

"Well, I talked to Mr. Murphy about a

new Commissioner of Labor and said we ought to appoint the very best man in the state. I spoke to him about John Mitchell. He wanted to know what was the matter with 'The' McManus for Labor Commis "I replied that, in my judgment, it

would never do to appoint McManus. He told me that he thought McManus was the best man for the place, and his appointment would be satisfactory to the labor organizations as well as to the 'organization,' meaning, of course, himself, "I told him under no circumstance would I agree to appoint McManus; that McManus had been to see me several times about it and had told me that he

telephone to him while I was Governor." in his opinion, was the best man for the that Mr. Murphy wanted me to appoint

Murphy's Objections to John Mitchell. "But about John Mitchell, Governor Sulzer? What was Mr. Murphy's objection

"I urged the peculiar qualifications of Mitchell, and he said Mitchell was not a Democrat, and that he was a Roosevelt man, adding: 'He is a Progressive and you are heading the same way."

"I replied that Mitchell was a good enough Democrat to get every Democratic vote in the Legislature of Illinois for United States Senator and to be cffered the Democratic nomination for Vice President at the Denver convention However,' I said, 'it is immaterial to me whether he is a Democrat or not. He is the most experienced and competent man in the state, in my opinion, for the place.

Refused to Put Murphy's Men on the Bench.

"We talked over the appointments to vacancies on the Supreme Court bench for the 1st Department. Mr. Murphy was very anxious that I should appoint Michael J. Mulqueen and Mr. Gillespie to two of these vacancies, and urged the matter on me very strongly. In talking about these appointments to the Supreme Court bench I told him under no circumstances would I appoint any lawyer to the Supreme Court unless it met with the approval of the Bar Association.

'As a matter of fact, I refused to name Mr. Murphy's candidates for the Supreme Court vacancies, but appointed Bartow S. Weeks and Eugene S. Philbin.

Threat to Wreck His Administration. "It was in this very conversation that Mr. Murphy said to me: 'Unless you do what I want you to do I will wreck your administration as Governor, block all your legislation, and defeat all your appoint-

"He said: 'Remember, I control the Legislature, and the Legislature can control the Governor.

"He also threatened me with public disgrace unless I agreed to his programme on legislative matters and appointments. "It was at this conference, too, that he talked about the things 'he had on me,' and said that I had better listen to him and not to his enemies up the state; that if I did what he told me to I would have things easy, and no trouble. and that if I didn't do what he wanted

spoke of the insulting threats of the Tammany boss. He clenched his fists and erunched his jaws until the muscles stood

Would Make Him a Laughing Stock.

of New York having to listen to such language from such a man! I told him highways and canals so far as I could hotel very much disheartened. that I was the Governor and that if he in spite of the desperate opposition of would let me alone I could succeed, but that I could not succeed if I was to be lature and in the departments. The reaa catspaw for him. I told him that I wanted to give the state an honest and to date are no greater than they are is efficient administration; that in my opinion that would do more to help the party

What did Mr. Murphy say to that, Governor?"

than anything else.

"He was very insulting. Then I asked him what he could do to destroy me. And he said: 'Never mind, you will find out in good time. Stand by the organization and you will be all right. If you go against the organization I will make your administration the laughing stock

me would run away from me just as soon as trouble began

"It was at this time that he asked me to call off George Blake, the commissioner who was investigating the prisons. He said that Blake must be called off and that he didn't want the prisons investiments I could not get my nominations gated unless we could agree upon some man to do it. I told him that Blake was an efficient man and that I was going to let him go on with his work, and he said: 'If you do you will be sorry for it. Mark what I am telling you now!'

"I told him what I had heard about the vileness of things in the Sing Sing and Auburn prisons. I said: 'We certainly ought not to stand for them. I want to get at the facts, and if there is anything wrong, stop it; if there is any graft, eliminate it."

anything done in connection with Sing Sing prison by Blake or any other man; that the warden there, Mr. Kennedy, was a friend of his and a good man and he wanted him left alone. This, remember, was the warden whom I afterward rewho was since indicted by the Westchester grand jury." As Mr. Sulzer told his story of the

boss's attempt to seize the state government he gave names and dates and places in a convincing, straightforward narrative. There was no hesitation, no evasion. He gave the facts like one who had been through an ordeal so terrible that every event had been burned into

McCall Murphy's Emissary. "When Mr. Murphy found out that he

could not use me and control me he sent emissaries to see me frequently to demand that I do certain things and to threaten me if I refused. You must not forget that I was then Governor of the Empire State. These threats began in a COLONEL SCOTT, the Superintendent of with greater vehemence up to the very night the Assembly passed the resolution phy's orders. "One of the agents through whom Mr.

Murphy most frequently communicated with me was Judge McCall. Judge McCall usually spoke of Mr. Murphy as 'the Chief,' and would say to me that 'the Chief' wished such and such a thing done or demanded that I follow such and such a course of action. "Every Tammany member of the Legis-

lature of either house who approached me from day to day used the same language saving that 'the Chief' demanded this or demanded that, or that 'the Chief' had telephoned to put through such a piece of legislation, or kill some other piece of

Refused to Serve "The Chief." "I was impeached, not because of any

misdoings, but because I declined to recinvisible and all-powerful 'Chief,' in the to his oath of office. government of this state; because I

Amazing Story Told of Plot to Wreck Career Because State's Chief Executive Refused to Do Fourteenth Street Bidding.

'GAFFNEY OR WAR" THE ULTIMATUM

Murphy Said to Me, 'Unless You Do What I Want You to Do I Will Wreck Your Administration and Block All Your Legislation' "-"He Also Threatened

ders, sent through emissaries at this end cause he had refused to obey the invis-

of the line. "I was impeached, and it is time that the whole people should realize the truth in all its enormity, because I tried, with whatever shortcomings, yet with all sincerity and earnestness of purpose, to be the servant of the whole people and not the servant of 'the Chief,' who desired, through me, to make his rule over the people of the state as absolute as it is

corrupt. "This 'Chief,' remember, tried last December to put me under financial obligations which would have bound me helplessly to him and which he believed would have insured my slavishly appointing the McCabes and the Gaffneys and the 'The'

McManuses. "Through Mr. Murphy and the people he sent to me everything that was brought out by the Frawley committee, by the Vermont perjury fabrication and by the breach of promise frame-up in Philadelphia was used in the secret effort to coerce me into obedience to the boss.

Blocked at Every Turn.

"My efforts for truly progressive gov ernment were blocked by the refusal of the Murphy Legislature to let me install in office men capable and willing to work out progress. Some of my plans were thwarted by the treachery of men I trusted, who took 'orders' from Mr. Murphy when I refused these 'orders.' Some me to I would have all the trouble I other reforms I had undertaken, like the advancement of conservation and the ef-Mr. Suizer's eyes fairly blazed as he fective regulation of public service corporations, were never even brought under way because Mr. Murphy planted his Legislature and his other tools squarely across my path. I was blocked at every

"Perhaps the chief service done for the Think of a Governor of the great State state in my administration was the Association That was the last time i stoppage of monumental frauds on the Murphy and his lieutenants in the Legisson why the revelations of thievery up that Mr. Murphy, when he saw that I meant to bring the thleves to justice, caused his Legislature to cut off every dollar of appropriations necessary to an effective investigation."

Contingent Fund Cut Off.

trembled with emotion. this state realize that for the first time in more than a generation the present whether given over the telephone or it "I told him that all I wanted was to Legislature refused to make the usual person. I knew the terrible odds against do right, be honest and carry out my and customary contingent fund appropriaone incident clearly show the vindictive character of the boss and his creatures Tried to Stop Investigation of Prisons. In their opposition and their desperate determination to prevent the exposure that my investigations were beginning

> to produce? "It is a literal fact that all that has been done to show up fraud was achieved with funds furnished by Commissioner Hennessy out of his personal resources, by volunteer work by several engineers and others, by a contribution of \$2,500 out of the funds given to me by friends fully considered my plight and the whole turing last fall's campaign, and by other funds subscribed recently by some of the same men as well as by others.

Indictments Secured. Nevertheless.

"Limited, thwarted, obstructed, threatened by Murphy's henchmen in all of the departments and in the various countles. have nevertheless managed to secure Indictments in Erie, Rockland, Westchester, Putnam, Suffolk and other countles. Approximately more than a score of men have been actually indicted during the last two months for gross frauds in the good roads department.

"Above all, based on the investigations moved from his place on charges and of Mr. Blake, to whom Mr. Murphy so vigorously objected, within the last two weeks, while I was actually being impeached, the Washington County Grand the grafters in the Great Meadows Prison

Final Interview with Murphy. "My final interview with Mr. Murphy in the late night of April 13 was marked in

my memory for his insolence to me and for the sordid brutality of his demands. "It was after the Jefferson banquet at the Waldorf. Mr. Murphy had gone nome, and afterward Judge McCall gone to my rooms with me from the banquet and waited an hour for Mr. Murphy to join us. He called him up on the telephone and said that Mr. Murphy asked me to go to see him at his house.

and went to Mr. Murphy's residence. It was after midnight and Mr. Murphy let us in at the door. We sat in the front parlor and talked over the situation at Albany-appointments, legislation and so on Mr. Murphy would agree to nothing I wanted, and I didn't agree to anything Murphy's Stand on Stilwell.

"I asked him not to interfere with the trial of Stilwell in the Senate. I said: "'What are you going to do about

" 'Stand by him, of course,' replied Mr. Murphy, 'Stilwell will be acquitted. It will be only a three-day wonder. do you expect a Senator to live on \$1,500 year? That is only chicken feed." It gave one a curious and ghastly thrill

to hear how a Governor of this great state, elected to represent the authority of nearly ten million persons, had to ed by the arrogant boss for the right to exercise his official functions according

Yet there stood Mr. Sulzer, crushed would not obey 'the Chief's' telephone or- and thrust forth from his high place be-

Me with Public Disgrace."

ible government. Whatever his faults may be, and what. ever may be the truth about his attitude toward campaign funds when he was running for office, there can be no doubt that he was honestly elected and no one can examine his official record since he took his oath of office, as I have, without realizing how hard he tried to be a faith.

ful Governor. "At this conference." said Mr. Sulper. I urged Mr. Murphy to let me carry out in good faith the platform pledges of the Democratic party for direct nominations We talked over the bill. I told him there was a strong sentiment throughout the state in favor of this legislation. He said I was mistaken, that there was no sentiment for direct primaries except from a

few cranks. "I called his attention to the pledge in the platform. He said he was opposed to any bill that abolished the state convention and eliminated the party emblem. "I said that there could be no honest

direct primary law unless that were done. He answered that the organization would never agree to any bill that did it and that such a bill would be overwhelmingly defeated in the Legislature. I said to him that UNLESS WE MADE GOOD ON DIRECT PRIMARIES WE WOULD LOSE THE STATE. He replied that I did not know what I was talking about

"We again talked over appointments to vacancies on the Supreme Court beach, and I said that I was being criticised by the judges and others for not filling the vacancies. He talked over several names that would be agreeable to him, Mulqueen, Gillespie and others. I told him that I thought I ought to select the very best lawyers I could get, and said again that I would make no appointments unless the names were approved by the Bar saw Mr. Murphy, and I returned to the

Threatened to Disgrace and Destroy Sulzer.

"Before we parted that night I warned Mr. Murphy that he would wreck the party and accomplish his own destruction if he persisted in shielding grafters and violating platform pledges. retort was that I was an ingrate, and

that he would disgrace and destroy me.

"Every man who has borne the weight of a great office like that of the Governor The tall figure stood still for a moment, of New York will appreciate my position. One hand was raised. Mr. Sulzer's voice I wished to keep in with the organization. I was anxious to avoid a break with it. "Good God!" he said, "do the people of I knew only too well the Legislature would obey Mr. Murphy's every order, tation; when I declined to turn my office into an instrument for the corruption of government and the debauching of the state. I was reluctant to break with Mr. Murphy. I did it only because it be came impossible to do otherwise and not betray my oath of office and forfeit every

shred of self-respect " It is impossible to put in words the earnestness and simple sincerity of Mr.

Sulzer's manner as he said this. "When I returned to Albany after my last interview with Mr. Murphy I carestate situation. It was only at that time, not since, that any thought of resigning

my office was in my mind, "There were three paths for me to travel; to surrender to Murphy and be unmindful of everything except his orders; to fight for what I believed was right regardless of Murphy, or to resign my office and give the people my reasons. "It did not take me long to determin not to surrender. I could not do that

and maintain my self-respect. "Could I fight and win? It did not seem possible. I knew that Mr. Murphy told the fact when he said he could and would block me in the Legislature I knew also that every state department was under his control, save the few I managed to hold against him. More than all, I knew from many years' knewledge of Murphy methods that, when desperate, he would stop at nothing to thwart me, even to the extent he has gone, which is

Signed His Resignation and Tore It Up

not his limit.

"I thought long and seriously about it all. My impulse was to fight; my knowledge of Murphy's control of everything and the fear in which he was held by every legislator and officeholder, made fight seem hopeless.

"I alone would be the victim in the end I was deeply in debt and Murphy knew it. I was without power over the Lesislature and Murphy knew it. Even friends of good government stood by, cynical, of fering much criticism but little real help-

"Then I wrote out and signed by resignation as Governor." "You actually signed your name to your

esignation?" "Yes. I signed my resignation. I seemed then the only thing to do. "But as I thought It all over finally it

looked cowardly. I tore up my resignation. The old determination to fight came to me and I made up my mind that no matter what the cost to me personally would fight and fight hard. "And I have fought hard from that moment to the present day of my unjust

enemies I have made and the conspiracy they have worked out against me. Every agency these enemies could use to destro me has been used. It is a long, pitiable story, miserably contemptible in its meanness and pettiness." Gaynor Encouraged Sulzer to Fight

Here Mr. Sulzer recalled a talk con cerning Mr. Murphy which was had w Mayor Gaynor at the Maine Memoria luncheon in the Plaza Hotel on May 30. "Wise, honest, old Mayor Gaynor," be